

B. JOHN CASEY, Bar No. 120025
john.casey@stoel.com
STOEL RIVES LLP
760 SW Ninth Avenue, Suite 3000
Portland, OR 97205
Telephone: 503.224.3380

MATTHEW M. WOLF (*Pro Hac Vice*)
matthew.wolf@arnoldporter.com
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP
601 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20001
Telephone: 202.942.5000

MARK A. PERRY (*Pro Hac Vice*)
mark.perry@weil.com
WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP
2001 M Street, NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20036
Telephone: 202.682.7000

Attorneys for Defendant The Kroger Company
(Additional counsel on signature page)

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

DISTRICT OF OREGON

PORTLAND DIVISION

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, STATE
OF ARIZONA, STATE OF CALIFORNIA,
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA, STATE OF
ILLINOIS, STATE OF MARYLAND,
STATE OF NEVADA, STATE OF NEW
MEXICO, STATE OF OREGON, and
STATE OF WYOMING,

Case No.: 3:24-cv-00347-AN

**DEFENDANTS' SUPPLEMENTAL
RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' REQUEST
TO SUBMIT POST-HEARING
EXHIBITS**

REDACTED

Plaintiffs,
v.
THE KROGER COMPANY and
ALBERTSONS COMPANIES, INC.,

Defendants.

On September 27, 2024, the parties submitted briefing on Plaintiffs' request to admit into evidence 114 disputed post-hearing exhibits. *See* Dkts. 484, 486. That same day, the parties filed their proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law. *See* Dkts. 480–81. Plaintiffs identified the list of disputed post-hearing exhibits in their briefing on the post-hearing exhibits, *see* Dkt. 482-2; however, Plaintiffs' proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law did not identify which exhibits were admitted into evidence during the hearing and which exhibits Plaintiffs seek to admit through the post-hearing exhibit process. Accordingly, to aid the Court's review of this issue, attached as **Exhibit A** is a version of Plaintiffs' proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law that highlights in blue the citations and corresponding factual assertions which cite, in whole or in part, to the disputed post-hearing exhibits.¹

DATED: October 7, 2024

ANGELI LAW GROUP LLC

/s/ David H. Angeli

DAVID H. ANGELI, Bar No. 020244
david@angelilaw.com
PETER D. HAWKES, Bar No. 071986
peter@angelilaw.com
121 SW Morrison Street, Suite 400
Portland, OR 97204
Telephone: 503.954.2232

AND

WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP

ENU A. MAINIGI (*Pro Hac Vice*)

Respectfully submitted:

STOEL RIVES LLP

/s/ B. John Casey

B. JOHN CASEY, OSB No. 120025
john.casey@stoel.com
RACHEL C. LEE, OSB No. 102944
rachel.lee@stoel.com
JACOB GOLDBERG, OSB No. 162565
jacob.goldberg@stoel.com
760 SW Ninth Avenue, Suite 3000
Portland, OR 97205
Telephone: 503.224.3380

AND

ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP

MATTHEW M. WOLF (*Pro Hac Vice*)

¹ Plaintiffs' filing included numerous yellow highlights related to confidentiality. For ease of reference, Defendants have removed that highlighting. Defendants have filed Exhibit A under seal, pursuant to Dkt. 331, and consistent with Plaintiffs' filing of this same document under seal.

emainigi@wc.com
JONATHAN B. PITTS (*Pro Hac Vice*)
jpitt@wc.com
A. JOSHUA PODOLL (*Pro Hac Vice*)
apodoll@wc.com
THOMAS W. RYAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)
tryan@wc.com
TYLER INFINGER(*Pro Hac Vice*)
tinfinger@wc.com
WILLIAM ASHWORTH (*Pro Hac Vice*)
washworth@wc.com
680 Maine Avenue SW
Washington, DC 20024
Telephone: 202.434.5000

AND

DECHERT LLP

JAMES A. FISHKIN (*Pro Hac Vice*)
james.fishkin@dechert.com
MICHAEL COWIE (*Pro Hac Vice*)
mike.cowie@dechert.com
ELENA KAMENIR (*Pro Hac Vice*)
elena.kamenir@dechert.com
1900 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20006
Telephone: 202.261.3300

HOWARD. M. ULLMAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)
howard.ullman@dechert.com
45 Fremont St, 26th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94105
Telephone: 415.262.4500

ROSS UFBERG (*Pro Hac Vice*)
ross.ufberg@dechert.com
YOSEF WEITZMAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)
yosi.weitzman@dechert.com
Cira Centre
2929 Arch Street
Philadelphia, PA 19104
Telephone: 215.994.2422

*Attorneys for Defendant Albertsons
Companies, Inc.*

matthew.wolf@arnoldporter.com
SONIA K. PFAFFENROTH (*Pro Hac Vice*)
sonia.pfaffenroth@arnoldporter.com
JOSHUA M. DAVIS (*Pro Hac Vice*)
joshua.davis@arnoldporter.com
KOLYA D. GLICK (*Pro Hac Vice*)
kolya.glick@arnoldporter.com
JASON C. EWART (*Pro Hac Vice*)
jason.ewart@arnoldporter.com
MICHAEL E. KIENTZLE (*Pro Hac Vice*)
michael.kientzle@arnoldporter.com
DAVID B. BERGMAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)
david.bergman@arnoldporter.com
MICHAEL L. WALDEN (*Pro Hac Vice*)
mike.walden@arnoldporter.com
YASMINE L. HARIK (*Pro Hac Vice*)
yasmine.harik@arnoldporter.com
ALLISON GARDNER (*Pro Hac Vice*)
allison.gardner@arnoldporter.com
BARBARA H. WOOTTION (*Pro Hac Vice*)
barbara.wootton@arnoldporter.com
CHRISTIAN SCHULTZ (*Pro Hac Vice*)
christian.schultz@arnoldporter.com
DAVID EMANUELSON (*Pro Hac Vice*)
david.emuelson@arnoldporter.com
MEI-WAH LEE (*Pro Hac Vice*)
mei-wah.lee@arnoldporter.com
WILSON DELOSS MUDGE (*Pro Hac Vice*)
wilson.mudge@arnoldporter.com
601 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20001
Telephone: 202.942.5000

JOHN A. HOLLER (*Pro Hac Vice*)
john.holler@arnoldporter.com
250 W 55th Street
New York, NY 10019
Telephone: 212.836.8000

BRIAN K. CONDON (*Pro Hac Vice*)
brian.condon@arnoldporter.com
777 S. Figueroa Street, 44th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90017
Telephone: 213.243.4000

JEREMY T. KAMRAS (*Pro Hac Vice*)

jeremy.kamras@arnoldporter.com
Three Embarcadero Center, 10th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: 415.471.3100

AND

WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP
MARK A. PERRY (*Pro Hac Vice*)
mark.perry@weil.com
LUKE SULLIVAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)
luke.sullivan@weil.com

LUNA N. BARRINGTON (*Pro Hac Vice*)
luna.barrington@weil.com
767 Fifth Avenue
New York, NY 10153
Telephone: 212.310.8000

SARAH M. STERNLIEB (*Pro Hac Vice*)
sarah.sternlieb@weil.com
700 Louisiana Street, Suite 3700
Houston, TX 77002
Telephone: 713.546.5000

BAMBO OBARO (*Pro Hac Vice*)
bambo.obaro@weil.com
201 Redwood Shores Parkway
Redwood Shores, CA 94065
Telephone: 650.802.3000

THOMAS B. FIASCONE (*Pro Hac Vice*)
tom.fiascone@weil.com
REBECCA SIVITZ (*Pro Hac Vice*)
rebecca.sivitz@weil.com
100 Federal Street, Floor 34
Boston, MA 02110
Telephone: 617.722.8314

Attorneys for Defendant The Kroger Company